

WEAVER - DIRECT

677

1 THE COURT: All right, Mr. Robertson.

2 MR. ROBERTSON: Thank you, Your Honor.

3 BY MR. ROBERTSON:

4 Q Dr. Weaver, if you would go to Volume 1 of the
5 exhibits, and specifically Plaintiff's Exhibit 105,
6 please. This document is entitled "Lawson Procurement
7 Punchout Trading Partner List." Do you see that?

8 A I do.

9 Q It says version 8X and 9.0, and it's dated
10 February 2009. Are you with me on that?

11 A Yes, sir.

12 Q What is this document?

13 A This is a list of the external vendors that Lawson
14 has set up partnerships with to make these people
15 Punchout partners.

16 Q There's a paragraph that begins "As specified
17 below," do you see that?

18 A On this?

19 Q On this first page, 105.

20 THE COURT: It's not on the first page.

21 BY MR. ROBERTSON:

22 Q I'm sorry. I apologize. On page 3 of the
23 document.

24 A Sure.

25 Q I was on the page. What does it indicate that?

WEAVER - DIRECT

678

1 A As specified below, Lawson delivers generic Rick
2 Punchout transaction sets and Commercial Extended
3 Markup Language purchase order formats for the listed
4 trading partner.

5 Q What does that mean with respect to this
6 procurement Punchout capability?

7 A It means that what they call transaction sets, the
8 exchange of information, this has already been
9 implemented and it's available. So when I, as a
10 customer, want to do business with a Punchout trading
11 partner that's already established by Lawson, it's
12 quick.

13 Q What do the next few pages indicate?

14 A These are lists of the names of the trading
15 partners.

16 Q In that same book, can you go to Exhibit 104,
17 Plaintiff's Exhibit 104. This document is entitled,
18 Punchout Partner Program?

19 A Right.

20 Q Have you reviewed this document?

21 A Yes, I have.

22 Q Were you aware that this document was discussed at
23 some depositions?

24 A Yes.

25 Q Did you review that testimony?

WEAVER - DIRECT

679

1 A Yes, I did.

2 Q Going to page 2 of the document, what does the
3 program overview provide?

4 A The program overview says, "Provide a formal
5 program for requesting, reviewing and adding new
6 Punchout or EDI trading partners."

7 Q Turn to page 5 of that exhibit. What's described
8 there?

9 A This is talking about the initial setup fees that
10 would be required to become a Punchout trading
11 partner. So in the first line, "Partners will be
12 expected to pay for initial setup." And the next to
13 the last paragraph, "Lawson Development will perform
14 the work required to enable the trading partner and
15 that trading partner will be added to our list of
16 supported partners."

17 Q What does Lawson tell its potential Punchout
18 trading partners its proposed benefits are on page 6
19 of this document?

20 A "Listing on our site as a procurement Punchout
21 partner. Listing in our documentation as a supported
22 Procurement Punchout Trading Partner. Invitation to
23 attend CUE," which are customer meetings. "Ability to
24 use Lawson Partner logo. An alliance contact." So
25 somebody at Lawson who will be responsible for trading

WEAVER - DIRECT

680

1 partner. "Access to Punchout specifications." And
2 "Listing in the Lawson's Partner directory."

3 THE COURT: Does your screen stay on?

4 THE JURY: Yes.

5 THE COURT: How about you-all? Are yours
6 going out on you?

7 THE LAWYERS: No.

8 THE COURT: I think it's just me. What
9 happens is I tap it and it will come back on
10 sometimes. Go ahead. Excuse me.

11 BY MR. ROBERTSON:

12 Q Dr. Weaver, I'd like you to take a look at
13 Plaintiff's Exhibit No. 212. And that is in Volume V.
14 And it's entitled, "Vendor Implementation Technical
15 Specifications Punchout Connectivity." Have you
16 reviewed this document?

17 A Yes, I have.

18 Q What is it?

19 A Lawson is providing the specifications that are in
20 this document to their Punchout trading partners
21 explaining how they implement this connectivity that I
22 talked about between the partner and Lawson. All
23 those exchanges of messages and formats and so on.

24 Q Can you go to page 3 of the document with the
25 Bates label 372?

WEAVER - DIRECT

681

1 A Yes.

2 Q There's a heading there called "Integration
3 Process"?

4 A Yes.

5 Q And it says, "Vendor/B2B partner connectivity."
6 Do you see that?

7 A I do.

8 Q What's your understanding as to what is being
9 discussed here?

10 A This is talking about the integration between the
11 Lawson Punchout capability and the technical items
12 that a Punchout vendor needs to have in order to do
13 this communication.

14 Q Is there further detail as to the Punchout setup
15 request provided in this document at page 6?

16 A Yes, there is.

17 Q I certainly don't want to go into all the detail
18 of that code that's there, but can you tell us
19 generally what your understanding is that is being
20 depicted there?

21 A Well, Mike, if you could do the bottom half of the
22 page.

23 In this exchange of information that's required
24 between Lawson and the Punchout partner, all the data
25 that's being exchanged has to be in a particular

WEAVER - DIRECT

682

1 format.

2 This is the format for just one of those functions
3 I talked about, the Punchout setup requests. So these
4 things like the data type definition and the computer
5 elements and the attribute list, all of this is just
6 an explicit listing of what data is required, in what
7 order it's required, what kind of data it should be.
8 Should it be digits, should it be alphabetic
9 characters. It's a complete specification of what's
10 needed to do the communication.

11 Q Earlier you talked about the Punchout setup
12 request when you were discussing that diagram?

13 A Eight-step diagram.

14 Q Is that what's being described there?

15 A Yes. This is the Punchout setup request.

16 Q If you turn to the next page, it says Punchout
17 setup response. Do you see that?

18 A So here is more code for Punchout setup response.

19 Q Next page is the Punchout order message or PO
20 requisition. Do you see that?

21 A Right.

22 Q Can you explain that as well?

23 A It's the same type of thing. It's the data type
24 definition for what occurs when and what type of data
25 has been transmitted.

WEAVER - DIRECT

683

1 Q Page 11, there's a discussion of the purchase
2 order?

3 A Yes, same type of thing for purchase order.

4 Q So who is providing all this code?

5 A All of this is being provided by Lawson.

6 Q So, Dr. Weaver, you've indicated earlier, you did
7 a demonstration concerning the operation of the Lawson
8 system with this procurement Punchout functionality;
9 is that right?

10 A That's right.

11 Q Why don't you preview it and tell us what we're
12 about to see here.

13 A All right. So I'm going to go to one of those
14 drop down menus. I find shop menu. I'm going to
15 click on Punchout. And then I'm going to go shopping
16 at two Punchout sites.

17 Q For the record, the video is Plaintiff's Exhibit
18 No. 368, and the hard copy screen shots of that video
19 are Plaintiff's Exhibit 367.

20 A Ready?

21 Q Yes.

22 A Okay.

23 Q I'm going to try not interrupt you so much this
24 time.

25 A So we're just looking at the screen of the laptop.

WEAVER - DIRECT

684

1 Continue. I'll click on Internet Explorer. I'll go
2 to favorites.

3 THE COURT: Before do you that --

4 THE WITNESS: Stop.

5 THE COURT: Just one minute.

6 Are you able to see your screens all right or
7 would it we better if we turned the lights out?

8 THE JURY: I'm okay.

9 A JUROR: I just need bifocals.

10 THE COURT: We don't provide those.

11 A JUROR: I know.

12 THE COURT: Okay. Excuse me, Dr. Weaver.

13 A So I've chosen the favorites tab, and the drop
14 down menu, and I chose the Lawson portal. Continue.

15 I do my user name and password. I login. So
16 there's a brief wait here, but I'll arrive at the
17 Lawson portal home. Okay. I'm finally there.

18 So I'll go over to that requisition self service,
19 and I'll come down to the shopping tab as I did
20 before. Stop.

21 So now here I am at the entrance to the shopping
22 module. I'm going to go up here to find and shop.
23 And I'm going to drop down that menu and choose
24 Punchout. Continue. Stop.

25 Before I get to making a choice of the Punchout

WEAVER - DIRECT

685

1 sites, I want to show you up here at the top the URL,
2 Universe Resource Locator, Web address that we're
3 talking to right now is this
4 lsfserver.corpnet.lawson. com. So that's the server
5 that is providing all the Lawson software that I'm
6 seeing here, which is the requisition self service.
7 But I want you to notice that URL because it's going
8 to change, and that's an important part of the case.
9 Continue. Stop.

10 So you notice that two icons were displayed. Dell
11 and Staples. So these are the two Punchout partners
12 that were available in the demonstration system that
13 we were given.

14 THE COURT: Do you know, Dr. Weaver, if you
15 hadn't been limited to these two, the two that you
16 were given, when you hit the Punchout button on the
17 drop down menu, would all of the punched out partners
18 come up in here or do you know that?

19 THE WITNESS: It would be all of the Punchout
20 partners that this customer had an agreement with.

21 THE COURT: So this customer first has to go
22 in and say, I want to do business with Dell, Staples,
23 Office Depot, Home Depot, whatever?

24 THE WITNESS: That's right, but there has to
25 be an agreement between the parties so that the

WEAVER - DIRECT

686

1 catalog can be customized and the prices can be
2 customized for customer.

3 THE COURT: Okay.

4 BY MR. ROBERTSON:

5 Q There's an agreement between Lawson and its --
6 when Lawson provides this Punchout capability, the
7 customer can tell Lawson what Punchout websites it
8 wants to go to?

9 A Exactly.

10 MR. McDONALD: Objection, leading.

11 THE COURT: Went out with the Coolidge
12 Administration on something like this.

13 MR. McDONALD: I have to have an objection to
14 move.

15 THE COURT: I know you need to move, but
16 that's --

17 Q I just want to follow up on the Judge's questions
18 because there was some ambiguity between who the
19 agreements were between. Does the Lawson customer
20 who's going to use this Punchout module, do they tell
21 Lawson what Punchout website they want to be able to
22 go to?

23 A That's correct.

24 Q So then Lawson puts that capability on this
25 Punchout module?

WEAVER - DIRECT

687

1 A That's correct.

2 Q So as many as they want Lawson could load on here;
3 is that right?

4 A As many as the customer says.

5 Q But the demo laptop that we got from Lawson only
6 had Staples and Dell; is that right?

7 A That's right.

8 THE COURT: When you say there are these
9 contracts between the customer, you in this instance,
10 and say you're going to do Staples, is that one of
11 those things that comes up and says "I agree to the
12 terms" and that's the end of it or is it actually
13 something else?

14 THE WITNESS: The contract is between Lawson,
15 Lawson and the trading partner. And then I as the
16 customer say -- and I have a whole list of trading
17 partners that we didn't bother to look at. I say, I
18 want to do business with IBM, and Staples and Office
19 Max and whoever.

20 THE COURT: But how do I get the terms? You
21 earlier said, Well, the ones that will drop down here
22 will be the ones that I, the customer, have an
23 agreement with, and they are going to then customize a
24 catalog for me. How does that happen?

25 THE WITNESS: Lawson makes that happen and

WEAVER - DIRECT

688

1 when we get to the site, it will be for me the
2 customer.

3 THE COURT: How does Lawson know to make it
4 happen?

5 THE WITNESS: Because the customer has said
6 which Punchout sites they want to have access to.

7 THE COURT: Okay.

8 BY MR. ROBERTSON:

9 Q Why don't we continue with the demonstration.

10 A All right. So I, as the Lawson user, click on
11 Staples. Continue. Stop.

12 If you can remember back to that 8-step diagram
13 that I showed you, I made a big point out of the fact
14 that a URL, a Universal Resource Locator, was returned
15 from the Punchout trading partner, and I wanted you to
16 see what that looks like. So instead of being
17 lsfsserver.corpnet.lawson.com, there's an extended part
18 of the URL here, and I realize this is very tiny, but
19 it says HTTPS, which is the secure version of the
20 Hypertext Transfer Protocol. And we're not going to
21 Staples, see, we're going to www.stapleslink.com. So
22 this is the special arrangement between Staples and
23 Lawson.

24 And when we go to that special site, we go to a
25 folder called web applications/WCS-stores-servlet. Do

WEAVER - DIRECT

689

1 you remember I used the word servlet. And the less
2 rest of it is obscured. It starts with S-T. It
3 probably says Staples, but you can't see it.

4 Anyway, this is the point that this URL is
5 returned by Staples. And this is where Lawson is
6 going to redirect me. This is my store at Staples.
7 Continue.

8 Pop up window. You can't get rid of those until
9 you click them away. Stop.

10 So what we just saw was I'm going to look at pens
11 pencils, and correction. All right. Continue.

12 That's what I just showed. Full screen. Okay.
13 Now we go up to the text box. Stop. And my search
14 query is I'm going to look for some furniture, and I
15 want to find items that are available through Staples
16 from two manufacturers, Basyx or Bush. So I type in
17 those names; Basyx or Bush. And that's my search
18 query. So having typed that in, now I click search.
19 Continue.

20 So in the normal return of information, I find
21 that the search for Basyx or Bush return the following
22 items. So here is a list by the type of furniture.
23 Down here is the number of items from Basyx. So
24 there's 150 furniture items from them and 150
25 furniture items from Bush. So I'll just continue.

WEAVER - DIRECT

690

1 So now I'm just paging through these items that
2 were returned from that search. Here's a second page.
3 Now, stop.

4 I'm going to click on cherry standard suites. So
5 I'm changing from looking at everything, first two
6 pages of everything, to looking at these 45 cherry
7 standard suites, piece of furniture. Continue.

8 Okay. So now, of course, our offerings are
9 reduced. There are 10 by Basyx and 35 by Bush. So
10 there will be 45 items that are potentially visible
11 here.

12 So I'll continue. So I'll click to the next page.
13 More items. Next page. More items. Fourth page.
14 More items. Stop.

15 So now out of these items that I have seen, I'm
16 going to pick the Basyx laminate bowfront desk, and by
17 clicking on this hyperlink, I'm going to drill down to
18 get more information from the catalog.

19 So continue. Stop. So here's the catalog
20 information that is returned by the Lawson system. So
21 you'll see we have a description here of the furniture
22 and then here it is in much more detail. So I get a
23 view of what's available.

24 So continue. Stop. And so here are some other
25 things that are available from the catalog. There is

WEAVER - DIRECT

691

1 the Staples item number. There's the manufacturer
2 number. The unit of measure and the price.

3 All right. Continue. Stop. What I did there was
4 click. In fact, Mike, can you back up a little bit?
5 I was too slow on the draw.

6 Okay. Stop. So I showed you that the catalog
7 items where I'm going next, that was the catalog
8 information. And what, if I can draw, what I'm going
9 to do next is click on delivery date. So I'm going to
10 check whether or not this item is available in
11 inventory.

12 Continue. So click on delivery date. Stop. So
13 here is the information that we saw before plus --

14 THE COURT: We've got a problem.

15 MR. McDONALD: Thank you, Your Honor. I'm
16 just trying to keep up with the paper version, but my
17 version of 367 ends here. Sorry, Your Honor.

18 THE COURT: You have a lot of paper. You all
19 have done very well with all that paper. Just a few
20 little slip-ups shows me that the legal assistants
21 have been doing what they should have done.

22 MR. McDONALD: I agree.

23 THE COURT: They are all human, but there
24 have been very few problems. So don't you worry about
25 it.

WEAVER - DIRECT

692

1 MR. McDONALD: Thank you, Your Honor.

2 THE COURT: Have you got it now?

3 MR. McDONALD: Yes, sir.

4 THE COURT: Okay.

5 A Okay. So now when we look at this expanded
6 information, we see the column of expected delivery.
7 And you notice it says backordered. So this item is
8 not available in inventory. I'm going to have to wait
9 for this. So I'd rather not do that. I wanted a
10 desk. So I'm going to continue. Go back. Go back.
11 So this takes me back into that cherry standard
12 suites.

13 So I'll look for something else. Go to the next
14 page. So now I'll pick this Bush Milano bowfront
15 desk. Here's its description. Stop.

16 And as you saw. So here's the catalog
17 description. Here's the item number. Here's the
18 manufacturer number. Here's the unit each and here is
19 the price. And we also have the opportunity to check
20 the delivery date on this. So I'll do that.

21 Continue. Click delivery date. Stop. And we
22 have a specific expected delivery date. Nothing about
23 backordered. So this item is available in inventory.
24 So I'll take this one.

25 So we continue. I add this to my order. Stop.

WEAVER - DIRECT

693

1 So this is my order as it stands here at Staples.
2 Notice that we're co-branded here with both Lawson and
3 the Punchout partner.

4 Okay. So that's the item that I want. So I'll
5 add that to the order. Continue. Stop. Review my
6 order. Stop.

7 So here's the same information that we saw before.
8 Looks good. So I'm now going to submit this order to
9 Staples.

10 So continue. Stop. So back to that 8-step
11 diagram I talked about, the exchange of information.
12 One of those steps was having the Punchout trading
13 partner take the content of the shopping cart and
14 return that information to Lawson. And so that is
15 what has happened with this last screen change.

16 Here's my Lawson shopping cart with that Bush
17 Milano desk in it. So I'm going to shop some more.
18 So we continue. I'll go to Dell. So now we're at the
19 Punchout Dell site. And let me just stop.

20 Once again, I'll point out here that URL you see
21 from the Lawson server, the Dell site has provided a
22 different URL than the normal Dell site. This
23 one is signin.Dell.com/Delllogin/portal/login.aspx.
24 ASPX is programming language. So I've been redirected
25 to this Dell training partner site.

WEAVER - DIRECT

694

1 Continue. Go full screen. And now I do a keyword
2 search for printer. I'll look at some printers. Go
3 to the next page.

4 I'll pick this Kodak Easy Share Printer. So I
5 drill down on this. Stop. And I've got the title.
6 I've got the description. I've got the price, but the
7 catalog tells me that it's temporarily out of stock.
8 Please check back soon. So this item is not available
9 in inventory. Okay. So I'll go get something else.

10 Continue. So I go up here to photo printers. And
11 look at the selection available from Dell for that.
12 Here's a Canon wireless printer. Stop.

13 Got my description. Got my price. Usually ships
14 within 24 hours. In addition, there's this other
15 information, the manufacturer part number. The Dell
16 part number and the UNSPSC code.

17 So this usually ships within 24 hours. So this
18 one is available in inventory. So I'm going to take
19 this one. So continue.

20 So I'll add this to the cart. All right. So
21 here's my Dell shopping cart. So it has the order
22 information. I'll create the order. Then Dell has
23 some trade compliance requirements not relevant to us.
24 Continue.

25 All right. Stop. Now, I guess we better continue

WEAVER - DIRECT

695

1 so we can see the descriptions. So continue. Right.

2 Now stop.

3 So here is that wireless printer. Look at the
4 information. It looks good. So I'm going to submit
5 this order. So continue. Stop.

6 So now I have exited the Dell partner site and I'm
7 back into the screen from the Lawson Punchout. And
8 notice that it says I'm retrieving items. So, again,
9 as part of that 8-step process flow between Lawson and
10 the trading partners, now Dell is taking the content
11 of the Dell shopping cart and returning that as the
12 Punchout order document, which is now being accepted
13 and saved by the Lawson system, and then we're going
14 to see that it will go into the Lawson shopping cart
15 up here. So continue. Stop.

16 So there is my wireless printer up here along with
17 my Bush Milano desk. All right. So those are the
18 only two things I wanted. So I now am going to
19 checkout from the Lawson shopping cart. Okay.
20 Continue.

21 All right. Stop. So this has created an order
22 within Lawson with the number, the identifier 919.
23 Like the first demonstration, this one needs approval.
24 So we'll March through that. So continue.

25 So back to the portal. Login as the manager.

WEAVER - DIRECT

696

1 Find the requisition. It's 919. Get the requisition.
2 Take a look at it. Okay. Stop.

3 I'm sorry, Mike. I went a little too long. Would
4 you back up just a tad? That's it.

5 So you see we have two line items here; the desk
6 and the printer.

7 When we scroll down here, you see we've got item
8 numbers and we've got manufacturer numbers. So
9 continue.

10 All right. So looks good to me. I'm going to
11 approve it. Okay. We've got that. So now I'm going
12 to run a PO 100 program. So like we saw before, I'll
13 enter a job name and a job description. I'll call it
14 requisition No. 919. I'll fill in these other items
15 that I need to below. Give it a delivery day of five.
16 Release the purchase order. Don't need the filters.
17 Back to main.

18 Okay. So this goods good. Looks good. I'm going
19 to add it. Now I'm going to submit the job to run.
20 And I explained about foregrounds and backgrounds. So
21 this is going to run and create the POs. So here's
22 the submission.

23 So now the POs are being created and in just a
24 second I can look at them. Give it time to process.
25 And then I'll go up and click on print manager.

WEAVER - DIRECT

697

1 I'll pick up requisition 919. Stop. And so here
2 we have the header of the PO that tells who is doing
3 the buying. It's our good old Metropolis Medical
4 Center. And then we'll scroll down to see the items.
5 Continue. Stop.

6 So here's our first PO. So it's coming from
7 Staples. It has a vendor item number. It's our Bush
8 Milano desk. It's a quantity of one. It's an unit of
9 each. And the PO is released. So the purchase order
10 has been created and released for this desk that I've
11 ordered from Staples.

12 Scroll down. Continue. Stop. So here's my
13 second PO. So this one is the wireless office
14 printer. It's coming from -- I'm not getting my
15 arrows. Oh, well. It's coming from Dell Computer.
16 It's got a vendor item number. The purchase order has
17 been released, and then at the bottom of this entire
18 document the report is complete and two purchase
19 orders were created.

20 So from my Punchout I picked a desk. I found out
21 it was not available in inventory. I picked another
22 desk. Put it in my shopping cart. Went to Dell.
23 Picked a printer. Found out it was not available.
24 Picked another printer. Put it in my shopping cart
25 checked out. Brought that back to Lawson. Created a

WEAVER - DIRECT

698

1 requisition. Created, in this case, two purchase
2 orders. That's it.

3 Q Thank you, Doctor. So with respect to this
4 demonstration, just like I asked you with respect to
5 the last demonstration, at a high level, I didn't want
6 to go through all the claim terminology right now, but
7 were we able to see in that demonstration that there
8 were at least two product catalogs?

9 A Yes.

10 Q Were you able to select the product catalogs?

11 A Yes.

12 Q Were you able to search for matching items in
13 those catalogs?

14 A Yes.

15 Q You did that?

16 A I did that.

17 Q Were you able to build a requisition?

18 A I did it.

19 Q Were you able to generate a purchase order?

20 A I did.

21 Q Did you see information about whether a product
22 was available in inventory?

23 A Yes, for the desk and the printer.

24 Q And there were images of the product?

25 A Since they were Punchouts we had images for all of

WEAVER - DIRECT

699

1 them.

2 Q Were there various descriptions and associated
3 information with the items?

4 A We saw the vendor item number. We saw the
5 manufacturer item number. We saw a description.

6 Q Did you see price?

7 A We certainly saw a price.

8 Q Was everything you saw there consistent with your
9 understanding of what a catalog is as defined by the
10 Court?

11 A Yes, it is.

12 Q Thank you.

13 I'd like to talk, just a little bit, about some
14 representatives that Lawson has made about how to
15 select among product catalogs if we could because
16 there's some dispute about whether there's one catalog
17 or more catalogs.

18 Could you go to -- let me first ask you what are
19 some of the item attributes that can be used for
20 selecting product catalogs to be searched?

21 A Well, we could use vendor item number. We could
22 use vendor name. Manufacturer item number.
23 Manufacturer name. Or partial description of the item
24 or the UNSPSC classification codes.

25 Q Going back to Plaintiff's Exhibit 170 again. This

WEAVER - DIRECT

700

1 is a response to an RFP. Specifically at page 37,
2 question 12. Are you with me?

3 A Not on page 37.

4 Q Of 170.

5 A 170. Right. So let's do the Bates number.

6 Q I'm sorry. 884.

7 A Okay.

8 Q In this question, the requester is asking does the
9 system have the ability for expand the item search by
10 a vendor catalog number, partial description,
11 manufacturer code, classification code, vendor name,
12 and manufacturer name. What does Lawson indicate of
13 its ability to do that?

14 A They put an X in column A, which says that that
15 capability is installed and is available.

16 Q Thank you. I'd like to go to Exhibit --

17 THE CLERK: I'm sorry. We couldn't hear you.

18 THE COURT: Which exhibit?

19 MR. ROBERTSON: Plaintiff's 215.

20 Q Again, this is in response to an RFP. Do you see
21 that, Doctor?

22 A Yes. This is the response to Jackson Health
23 System.

24 Q And it's dated May 18, 2006?

25 A Correct.

WEAVER - DIRECT

701

1 Q If you could go to the page that has the Bates
2 label 6172.

3 A Okay.

4 Q Again, we're talking about functional capability
5 here about expanded search. Do you see that?

6 A Yes.

7 Q Just confirm for me this is Lawson's response to
8 this request by the Public Health Trust, Jackson
9 Health system; is that right?

10 A That is correct, but we need to get the right page
11 up here.

12 Q If you'll look at the bottom, it has Bates No. 150
13 of 307. Right at the bottom middle.

14 A Your page numbers are different than mine, but I'm
15 on the right page.

16 Q You're on the page that ends 6172?

17 A 6172, but that's not what's on the screen.

18 Q Okay.

19 A There we go.

20 Q We were discussing here functional capability and
21 expanded items searched by. Do you see that?

22 A Yes.

23 Q It says here "vendor catalog number." What does
24 Lawson say about its availability?

25 A Under the currently available column, it says yes.

WEAVER - DIRECT

702

1 Q And partial description of item, e.g. wildcard
2 contains, etc.?

3 A Yes.

4 Q Manufacturer catalog number?

5 A Yes.

6 Q Classification code?

7 A Yes.

8 Q Vendor name?

9 A Yes.

10 Q Manufacturer name?

11 A Yes.

12 Q Are you aware of the contention that Lawson
13 maintains that an item master is a single catalog
14 rather than a collection of catalogs?

15 A Yes.

16 Q Do you agree or disagree with that?

17 A I disagree.

18 Q Why is that, sir.

19 A I think if you have multiple vendor catalogs and
20 you import them into a single database, you have one
21 database, but you still have multiple item catalogs
22 because it has all of the information in it that was
23 originally in the vendor catalogs.

24 Q And what about with respect to the Punchout
25 catalogs that were available? Do you have an opinion

WEAVER - DIRECT

703

1 as to whether that's a multiple catalog availability
2 or a single catalog?

3 A Well, as we just saw when we did our Punchout
4 Staples and Dell, those were two completely separate
5 catalogs on separate websites run by different people.
6 So those are unquestionably separate catalogs.

7 Q Do you have an understanding about whether the
8 '683 patent, for example, requires catalogs to be
9 searched simultaneously?

10 A It does not.

11 Q Did the Court in any of its claim constructions
12 have that requirement?

13 A No, that's not in the claim construction.

14 Q Does the Lawson system have the capability of
15 enabling you to select search first a product catalog
16 and then subsequently select a search in another
17 product catalog?

18 A Yes.

19 Q Do you see that in any of your demonstrations?

20 A Yes, we did. The Bush or Basyx.

21 Q In the demonstration in Punchout, did we see that
22 ability to select those product catalogs?

23 A Yes, we did because we saw that in Dell and in
24 Staples.

25 Q Why don't we talk a little bit about searching for

WEAVER - DIRECT

704

1 selected product catalogs using the Lawson keyword
2 index?

3 THE COURT: Excuse me. Before you do that,
4 are you saying in your view item master is not a
5 single catalog but is a multiple catalog because it
6 has imported into it all number of parts of other
7 catalogs?

8 THE WITNESS: Well, let me just be clear.

9 THE COURT: Yes.

10 THE WITNESS: If the item master is built by
11 importing multiple vendor catalogs, then in my opinion
12 is that database contains multiple vendor catalogs.

13 THE COURT: But what if it is built by
14 importing part of multiple catalogs, parts of
15 catalogs?

16 THE WITNESS: In my opinion, it's still
17 multiple catalogs.

18 THE COURT: I just want to know -- and it's
19 because in those instances you think it's a function
20 of importation?

21 THE WITNESS: Yes, sir.

22 THE COURT: All right.

23 BY MR. ROBERTSON:

24 Q Does the Lawson system have the capability of
25 importing multiple vendor catalogs?

WEAVER - DIRECT

705

1 A Yes. We saw that in the documentation with the PO
2 536 program.

3 Q Did you see representation that Lawson said they
4 could import multiple catalogs?

5 A Yes, we did.

6 Q So I did want to address this searching the
7 selected product catalogs using Lawson's keyword
8 search. You're familiar with that?

9 A Yes.

10 Q Are you familiar with Lawson's contention that it
11 searches the entire item master and therefore the
12 Lawson systems don't, and its search engine, does not
13 search only selected portions of catalogs, but rather
14 the entire item master?

15 A I'm aware of that, but I disagree with that.

16 Q Why do you disagree with that?

17 A Because the way that the system is built it uses a
18 search index. If you think about building a complex
19 system, you would never build it such that you had to
20 search through every single item in order to match a
21 search query. It would take forever if the database
22 was of any size. So that's not the way relational
23 databases get built.

24 Instead there's a search index, and so like the
25 index of a book, you have keywords, and they point to

WEAVER - DIRECT

706

1 where in the database those items reside.

2 So if I do a keyword search for Dell, I look it up
3 in the index, and that tells me where the Dell items
4 are, and I only look at those.

5 Q Do you have any demonstratives that you prepared
6 to help illustrate this point?

7 A I do.

8 Q Could we go to 09 at page 15. Okay. Here you
9 have a definition of an index from Webster's New World
10 Computer Dictionary. What significance here should we
11 be focused on as you talk about this computer search
12 index that's being utilized?

13 A This part here. When searching or sorting the
14 database, the program uses the index rather than the
15 full database. Such operations are faster than sorts
16 or searches performed on the actual database.

17 Q As a computer scientist, is using an index in
18 order to search a relational database something that
19 is utilized in order to make those faster searches?

20 A Absolutely.

21 Q Do you know how the Lawson's system search index
22 is created?

23 A Yes.

24 Q What is that?

25 A There's a process by which keywords are defined

WEAVER - DIRECT

707

1 that are going to become searchable. So there's a
2 keyword search setup program that you run, and then
3 after you've defined what keywords are going to be
4 searchable and you've got your database loaded, and
5 the item master is now full of data, you run the
6 keyword search load program. That builds the index.

7 And now until you have changed the database, you
8 have got an index into all the searchable keywords
9 that -- all of the keywords that were chosen to be
10 searchable.

11 Q Are some of those keywords like item description,
12 item number, classification code that you've been
13 addressing already?

14 A Yes, they are.

15 Q Which database tables is the search index built?

16 A I'm sorry. Say that again.

17 Q Sure. From which database tables is the search
18 index built?

19 A The item master. Well, and the vendor item table,
20 too.

21 Q Once the user has selected the field of the item
22 data that are to be searchable, what is the next step
23 in building this index?

24 A So after you have chosen your keywords, you have
25 to load them all, and then you -- the computer system,

WEAVER - DIRECT

708

1 the keyword search load program, builds this index
2 that is search engine then uses thereafter.

3 Q Can you take a look at Plaintiff's Exhibit
4 No. 136. It's in Volume III. It's entitled,
5 "Requisition Self Service 8.1, 9.0."

6 A Yes.

7 Q What is this exhibit, if you know?

8 A This is a training program for requisition self
9 service. This particular one is a copy of what a
10 human trainer would be using in terms of slides and
11 notes. So if you're familiar with Microsoft
12 PowerPoint, it has a notes feature. So here is the
13 slide itself, and below it are the notes. So if I
14 were a trainer training you as an RSS class, I would
15 be showing you this picture up here, and then this
16 would be my reminder text of what I wanted to tell you
17 about the slide that I'm showing you. Instead of
18 having an audio recording, you've got words.

19 Q Is this a presentation that Lawson gives to train
20 its customers?

21 A Yes.

22 Q Why don't we go to page 3 of the document, if we
23 could. It's Bates label is 687.

24 A Right.

25 Q What would you like us to focus on here?

WEAVER - DIRECT

709

1 A The first two paragraphs. You can search the
2 catalog, which will search for items in your item
3 master or vendor items. It also allows you to search
4 for keywords for up to 29 fields based on your set up.
5 You can also search based on categories which can use
6 the UNSPSC code categories. And I think we've heard
7 the rest of that before.

8 Q We've gone over that. Let me direct you then to
9 page 12 of the document. Is this a Lawson keyword
10 search setup proposal?

11 A Well, this is the training guide and --

12 Q This is teaching the customers how to set up the
13 keywords?

14 A Yes, it is.

15 Q What's the next page?

16 A Keyword search load.

17 Q What is that?

18 A So that was the second program that you have to
19 run. The first one, the keyword search set up, this
20 is where you choose which of the 29 different fields
21 will become searchable. So after you have got them
22 chosen, and you've got your item master database
23 loaded, then you run the keyword search load, and it
24 builds the index.

25 Q Then if you will turn to page 29. There's a slide

WEAVER - DIRECT

710

1 there that says "creating a requisition by searching
2 the catalog"?

3 A Yes.

4 Q What's being depicted there?

5 A So this is something that we have seen. When I
6 did the catagory search and picked items and built a
7 requisition. So it says down here, When using the
8 search catalog task, you enter the value you want to
9 look for in the search field. As soon as you type in
10 the third letter, the system begins searching for the
11 matching keywords and displays the result as a drop
12 down list.

13 Keywords exist because you enable certain fields
14 as searchable in this IC00.5 program and run IC800 to
15 build keywords from these fields.

16 So that's the setup and load. IC800 is the
17 keyword load.

18 Q So what if anything do the pages of this document
19 have with respect to your understanding of how the
20 Lawson system or whether the Lawson system uses a
21 search index to conduct its searches?

22 A Well, it absolutely does such that it need not
23 search the entire database. That's what keyword setup
24 is about and how a keyword load turns that into an
25 actual index.

WEAVER - DIRECT

711

1 Q So once you have enabled the keyword terms and you
2 built the search index, how does the Lawson search
3 engine conduct a search of the item data in the
4 database?

5 A So if I type in a word into a text box, say Dell,
6 and engage the search engine, it goes to the search
7 index. It looks up Dell. It finds records in the
8 database that match the keyword Dell. And then it
9 extracts that data from the database and presents that
10 to me on the screen.

11 Q Do you have a demonstrative you prepared to try
12 and illustrate how this search index operates?

13 A I do.

14 Q What's being illustrated here, sir?

15 A Okay. So up here at the top we have the text box,
16 which is the search query. I don't know where that
17 popping is coming from.

18 THE COURT: That's because you, like some
19 witnesses, but not all, articulate your P's in a
20 particular way at a particular length from the
21 microphone, and there isn't anything that we've been
22 able to do about it. And it's not your fault. It's a
23 function of the way things are.

24 THE WITNESS: Thank you, Your Honor.

25 THE COURT: It's annoying, but --

WEAVER - DIRECT

712

1 THE WITNESS: I would have worried about that
2 all night.

3 THE COURT: Well, don't.

4 MR. McDONALD: As long as he doesn't use the
5 T sound for the rest of the testimony, it's fine.

6 THE COURT: No, it's a P, generally.

7 Does this have an exhibit number?

8 MR. ROBERTSON: No, Your Honor. It's simply
9 demonstrative.

10 THE COURT: All right.

11 A So we have our keywords at the top, our query
12 text, and for this example I want to look for the
13 keywords Dell and monitor. We'll assume that we have
14 enabled at least two fields, two keyword fields to be
15 searchable. One of them would be a user-defined field
16 for the manufacturer. We haven't actually talked
17 about user defined fields yet, but this is part of the
18 Lawson product. So a user defined field or
19 manufacturer has been determined to be searchable. It
20 has been declared to be searchable. And a second
21 field, the item description, which is one of the
22 fields, one of the 29 fields supported by Lawson, that
23 one has also been declared to be searchable.

24 Now, after I do the search load and I build my
25 index, then what I have is for each of the entries in

WEAVER - DIRECT

713

1 the user-defined field for manufacturer, like Dell or
2 Hewlett-Packard or Gateway, for each of those I have
3 pointers into the database that tell me where I will
4 find a record, a product, in which the Dell keyword
5 was located in the user-defined field for
6 manufacturer.

7 Likewise, for the item description fields, if I've
8 got a database that contains keywords like keyboard
9 and mouse and monitor, every time a descriptive term
10 is found that is searchable for item description like
11 keyboard, in this database there are pointers from the
12 index into the database that say where that item is
13 found.

14 So the way this then works is when I put in Dell
15 and monitor, the search engine goes to the search
16 index, finds the keyword Dell, finds all of the places
17 that the keyword Dell would appear in the database.
18 In this case its locations are 10, 20, 25, 26, 27 and
19 28.

20 Then it would look for the next keyword in the
21 query box. That's monitor. It would look up all of
22 the places in the database where monitor appears as
23 keyword. And that's 15, 16, 17, 19, 20, 21, 22, 23,
24 25 and 27.

25 Then having found where the records containing the

WEAVER - DIRECT

714

1 keyword Dell are located and where the records
2 containing the keyword monitor are located, then we do
3 the intersection of those. That is, from those two
4 lists of numbers, we find where the numbers are
5 exactly the same.

6 So in my example here, 25 and 27 are the database
7 records that contain both the keywords Dell and
8 monitor.

9 So I go fetch records 25 and 27. And that's what
10 I display to the user. So I don't search the whole
11 database. I just the index to search selected parts.

12 THE COURT: Mr. Robertson, what is this
13 testimony related to? We had that at the beginning.
14 Now we've had a lot of testimony, and I'm confused a
15 little bit, and the jury may be, about what exactly
16 this line relates to. Does it have to do with whether
17 there's a search of a single catalog or not? Is that
18 what we're still on?

19 MR. ROBERTSON: No, Your Honor. There are
20 some claims that say you have to search portions of
21 the database or search among the selected catalogs.
22 And so in order to search portions of the database,
23 you need a search index. Lawson contends that the
24 index is -- that the search searches the entire
25 database all the time. So, therefore, they can't

WEAVER - DIRECT

715

1 satisfy the selected portions.

2 So they employ a search index in order to be
3 able to go quickly to find the data record that they
4 need.

5 THE COURT: I understand. I have this
6 question now. The database that is being searched in
7 either version, either Lawson's theory or ePlus'
8 theory, is made up of what?

9 THE WITNESS: What is the database made up
10 of?

11 THE COURT: Yeah, what's it searching?

12 THE WITNESS: Well, it uses the index to
13 search the item master and the vendor item table.

14 THE COURT: It's searching the item master
15 and --

16 THE WITNESS: Let me be more precise.

17 THE COURT: I know we're talking about
18 searching catalogs, and I think I'm confused about
19 what the issue is. So go ahead and try it again.

20 A So what's going on is that there are many keyword
21 fields like item number, item description, these
22 user-defined fields that can be marked as searchable.
23 This's part of the setup.

24 Then when information is loaded into the item
25 master and vendor item table, you use this keyword

WEAVER - DIRECT

716

1 search load program, and it builds this index, the one
2 that I'm showing on the screen.

3 Thereafter, whenever I do a search, I'm using the
4 index to search only selected parts of the database,
5 not the whole database.

6 THE COURT: All right. I understand that,
7 but the database is what?

8 THE WITNESS: The database is the item master
9 table and the vendor item table.

10 THE COURT: And the database contains
11 extracts or parts of different catalogs, right?

12 THE WITNESS: Each item record and item
13 master represents some product from a vendor catalog.

14 BY THE COURT:

15 Q Doctor, let me ask you this.

16 THE COURT: I think I may be confusing things
17 more than I am doing any good. So I'll leave it
18 alone.

19 BY MR. ROBERTSON:

20 Q Have you ever seen this search index being
21 analogized to an index for a book, for example?

22 A I have.

23 Q If we had a book that was his history of the Civil
24 Wear, and it had an index with a number of topic
25 headings and number of pages. If I wanted to go to

WEAVER - DIRECT

717

1 the Battle of Vicksburg, instead of going through
2 every single page of the book to find the chapter on
3 the Battle of Vicksburg, how could I use an index in
4 order to go directly to where that data record would
5 be located in that database, if you will?

6 A That's a good analogy. So if I've got this Civil
7 War history book and I want to learn about Battle of
8 Vicksburg, I don't start on page 1 and go to page 2
9 and 3 and 4 reading it all to see if it says anything
10 about Battle of Vicksburg.

11 I go to the back to the index. I look up under
12 the alphabetical list. I looked up V. I find the
13 Battle of Vicksburg. And it says pages 301 and 402.
14 So I go back to the book and I look up pages 301 and
15 402. And those are the data record items that are
16 analogous to the Lawson system.

17 Q So referring back now to your demonstrative,
18 what's happened is someone has assigned essentially a
19 number to a particular topic, and those can actually
20 be cross-referenced, is that right, to go immediately
21 to where the data record is locate in the database?

22 A They're not cross-referenced, but they are
23 pointers into the database.

24 Q And using those pointers, you can quickly go to
25 the record rather than going through every single

WEAVER - DIRECT

718

1 record that's in the database?

2 A Exactly.

3 Q And just so I can -- this is relevant to Claim One
4 of the '172, for example. Do you have that in front
5 of you?

6 A This is the database claim.

7 Q It's Plaintiff's Exhibit 3, for example. Go to
8 Claim One. We'll just focus on that first element.
9 Some of the other claims now, Doctor, you have seen
10 that they have referred to at least two other product
11 catalogs?

12 A Yes, we've seen a lot of those.

13 Q In this Claim One, there's not a catalog
14 requirement, is there?

15 A No, nothing about catalogs here. It's talking
16 about a database.

17 Q If we could just highlight that first element. So
18 here it says a database containing data relating to
19 items associated with at least two vendors maintained
20 so that selected portions of the database may be
21 searched separately. Do you see that?

22 A I do.

23 Q Is this index a useful tool in being able to
24 search selected portions of the database separately?

25 A Yes, it is.

WEAVER - DIRECT

719

1 Q Let me ask to you look down at Plaintiff's Exhibit
2 No. 136, I believe. I'm sorry. I apologize. 127,
3 which is the first exhibit in Volume III. Have you
4 seen this document before?

5 A I have.

6 Q It's entitled, "Application Design Document for S3
7 Item Search Center."

8 A Correct.

9 Q Let me direct you to the page that ends with Bates
10 label 060.

11 A Okay.

12 Q The heading there, it's 3.1 S3 item search. Do
13 you see that?

14 A Yes.

15 Q This S3 product, is that the procurement system
16 that Lawson offers that's being accused here?

17 A It is.

18 Q What does it represent here with respect to the
19 search index that's available for Lawson?

20 A The S3 item search center has the capability to
21 search for item information within the item master,
22 the item master table. Item location, item loq table,
23 and vendor item, P.O. item inventory table.

24 The table below lists the database tables and
25 fields that are searchable.

WEAVER - DIRECT

720

1 Q What does that indicate to you?

2 A So what we have here are a list of fields that can
3 be marked as searchable. And then this index is built
4 from these fields.

5 Q Does it include vendor item?

6 A The first one is vendor item. The second one is
7 description. And below that we have what I referred
8 to earlier as user-defined fields. So there are five
9 user-defined fields, which simply means that the user
10 can use them anyway the user likes. You could use the
11 field as a vendor code, for example.

12 Q Going to the next page, is it also indexed for
13 commodity code?

14 A Yes, there's commodity code, there's stock unit of
15 measure, and down at the bottom is vendor.

16 Q Can you turn to the last page of Plaintiff's
17 Exhibit 127, and there's an asterisk there that
18 says -- well, why don't you tell me what you
19 understand that to mean?

20 A After vendor was the asterisk. And on this page
21 the asterisk is explained. This is true for more
22 fields than just vendor. These elements can only be
23 used in combination with a search value to filter the
24 results of a search.

25 Q Can you translate that for us? What does that

WEAVER - DIRECT

721

1 mean?

2 A So in the advanced search page that is a part of
3 this system, you can put in keywords that you want to
4 search for, and you can put in keywords that you want
5 to ignore.

6 Q Does this table tell us anything about whether you
7 can search in the Lawson S3 system by vendor?

8 A It says you can.

9 Q Now, you reviewed Lawson's expert report; is that
10 right?

11 A I did.

12 Q Do you know whether or not he acknowledged that
13 the vendor name field can be used in combination with
14 another search value to filter the search by vendor
15 name using this search functionality?

16 A He did.

17 Q Dr. Weaver, I'd like to talk to you a little bit
18 about the '516 patent claims, and we're going to have
19 a video at some point with respect to some of that
20 functionality that's claimed in that patent; is that
21 right?

22 A Yes.

23 Q Can we just go to Claim One of '516? Now, this is
24 a fairly lengthy claim, Doctor, and I certainly don't
25 want to take the time to read it into the record here,

WEAVER - DIRECT

722

1 but at a high level, can you tell us generally what is
2 going on here directed to this type of claim and what
3 the elements are doing here with the sort of overall
4 essence of what this claim is?

5 A Okay. So there's a collection of catalogs.

6 There's a first set of predetermined criteria.

7 Q That's tricky word. At least it sounds tricky.

8 What is it?

9 A The things that that could be are many of the
10 items that -- yeah. Many of the things that we've
11 already mentioned like item number, manufacturer
12 number, vendor number, vendor name, description of the
13 product, UNSPSC classification code.

14 Q These are all criteria that can be used for
15 searching that are determined ahead of time?

16 A Yes. And then there is a second set of those
17 criteria, and the content of that set could be the
18 same as the content of the first set.

19 Then there's a catalog selection protocol whereby
20 you use the first predetermined criteria to select
21 less than all of the catalogs. And then you use the
22 second predetermined criteria to search within that
23 subset in order to find matching items.

24 Q So let me see if I understand then. What we're
25 doing here is search refinement. That is, we can

WEAVER - DIRECT

723

1 start out with broad categories and narrow our search
2 in order to arrive at the object of what we want to
3 purchase, for example, in this configuration of
4 electronic sourcing system; is that right?

5 A Right. So an example would be if my first
6 predetermined criteria was Dell, I could select a
7 subset of the catalogs that contain an item from Dell,
8 and if my second criteria was Dimension 8100, which is
9 a particular Dell model, I could look within those
10 catalogs for those items that are Dell Dimension
11 8100s.

12 Q Are there some of the catalog selection protocols
13 described there? What is your understanding of what a
14 catalog selection protocol is? First of all, the
15 Court has defined what a protocol is. So let's just
16 that your definition. Do you recall what that is?

17 A For protocol?

18 Q Yes. It's on the first page.

19 A A procedure.

20 Q So let's call a catalog selection procedure, if
21 you will, since that is the Court's definition, and
22 can you tell us your understanding of that element?
23 What is it?

24 A So there's a user interface that allows me to
25 input a criteria that's going to select less than all

WEAVER - DIRECT

724

1 of the catalogs.

2 Q There was criteria we talked about. It could be
3 the first set of criteria. These attributes we've
4 been talking about such as vendor name and
5 manufacturer number, vendor number, textural
6 description?

7 A Right. All of those I mentioned as examples of a
8 first set of predetermined criteria.

9 Q Then you can use that second set of criteria that
10 include those in the first set that then refine the
11 search?

12 A Correct.

13 Q This last element is search program. Search
14 program relying on said second set of criteria to
15 select specific items from the catalogs for said
16 catalogs determined from the catalog selection
17 protocol. What is going on there?

18 A So you need a search program that uses that second
19 criteria in order to find specific items within the
20 catalogs that were sub selected by your choice of the
21 first criteria.

22 Q Do you have a demonstration to illustrate whether
23 or not the Lawson system performs in a manner that is
24 implicated by Claim One of the '516 patent?

25 A Yes.

WEAVER - DIRECT

725

1 Q It's been represented to me it's very short.
2 Would you like me to proceed, Your Honor. It's
3 Plaintiff's Exhibit 364 is the video and Plaintiff's
4 Exhibit 363 are the corresponding hard copy screen
5 shots.

6 A Stop.

7 Q Dr. Weaver --

8 A Are you ready?

9 Q Maybe we should make an effort not to stop as much
10 so we can have more of a narrative if the Court would
11 permit.

12 THE COURT: Whatever he wants to do. I think
13 he was waiting for you to do a question.

14 Q Can we proceed with the demonstration?

15 A We can. All right.

16 Q Can you preview it for the jury and tell us what
17 we're going to see here?

18 A Yes, we're going to see searching for the first
19 criteria of Dell. And then from those catalogs, we'll
20 see that there are multiple vendors for Dell. And
21 then we'll refine the search with a Dimension 8100,
22 and we'll find that there are multiple vendors for a
23 more specific search inquiry, and that satisfies the
24 elements of Claim One of the '516.

25 THE COURT: What are the exhibit numbers?

WEAVER - DIRECT

726

1 MR. ROBERTSON: 364 is the video and 363 are
2 the hard copies.

3 A Let's go. Pick the browser. Pick the favorite.
4 Pick the portal.

5 Q Don't go so fast, Doctor, that we lose the import
6 of the point you're trying to make?

7 A I have contradictory instructions.

8 Q I apologize.

9 A This part you have seen before. So no problem.
10 We're waiting for the portal to load. Okay. We're
11 there. Some requisition self service, shopping, and
12 from our drop down menu we'll now pick search catalog.
13 Stop.

14 So here is the query text box into which I am
15 going to put the first predetermined criteria.
16 Continue.

17 THE COURT: Excuse me. What do you
18 understand the catalog that's being searched in the
19 drop down when it says "search catalog"?

20 THE WITNESS: Well, in this case --

21 THE COURT: Where is it going to search?

22 THE WITNESS: In this case it's searching the
23 database of item master and vendor table and, this
24 contains all the catalogs that are in the internal
25 database.

WEAVER - DIRECT

727

1 THE COURT: But it's not Punchout at all?

2 THE WITNESS: No, sir.

3 THE COURT: Because you have Punchout to get
4 the outside vendors?

5 THE WITNESS: That's exactly right.

6 THE COURT: So you search item master and
7 what do you call it?

8 THE WITNESS: Vendor item table.

9 THE COURT: Vendor item table. It says
10 search catalog. Okay. Go ahead.

11 A So stop. Now, I'm about to enter the first
12 predetermined criteria. I need to tell you, though,
13 that you see over here as part of this advanced search
14 feature there are -- you only see a partial list of
15 keyword fields that can be searched.

16 So if I wanted to really tightly control the
17 aspects of this search, I could go in and pick, say,
18 the item number. I wish I had the -- I'll try this.
19 I can pick the item number. I can pick the item
20 description. I could pick, say, the first alphabetic
21 user field. I could designate what fields I want to
22 be searched by whatever I put in this text box, but
23 what I have done is to click over here on search all
24 the fields.

25 So in my demonstration all of the fields that are

WEAVER - DIRECT

728

1 available are going to be searched using that search
2 index. Okay. Go.

3 So I type in Dell. Stop. So here are the records
4 in the database that include the keyword Dell.
5 Continue.

6 So there are several. Let me pick the first one
7 and drill down on that. Okay, stop. So this is a
8 Dell Dimension 8100 Pentium 4 computer. It's
9 available from Dell Computer. Okay. Continue.

10 I go back. I look at another entry. Stop. All
11 right. Here's a Dell Dimension 8100 Pentium 4, but
12 this one is available from Diablo. The first one from
13 Dell, the second one from Diablo. Continue.

14 Go back. Now, I'm going to add the second
15 predetermined criteria. So I'll put in Dimension
16 8100. I'll search for that. Stop.

17 Now, instead of all entries and catalogs that
18 contain the keyword Dell, I have those catalogs
19 containing the keyword Dell that contain the keyword
20 Dimension 8100. Continue.

21 So here's that first one. That was available from
22 Dell. Here's the second one. It's available from
23 Diablo. And that's important because when we drill
24 down to the claim, what it says is that I have to be
25 able to find an item from one vendor and then the item

WEAVER - DIRECT

729

1 from a second vendor. And that's what I've done here.

2 THE COURT: So you can compare and find one
3 is \$1,000 and one is \$1,400?

4 THE WITNESS: Yes.

5 THE COURT: And decide which one you want to
6 buy. Do you have the same product?

7 THE WITNESS: In this case I do, yes.

8 MR. ROBERTSON: Your Honor, we're about to
9 move onto another topic. It's not going to be that
10 long, but it's another topic.

11 THE COURT: Well, you're using time
12 measurements of which I am familiar; very short and
13 not that long. What do you have in mind? The jury
14 has been at it for a while. I think this is a good
15 time to let them go home. You get worn out after a
16 while focusing on all the details. You're paying
17 attention carefully and we all appreciate that very
18 much, but why don't you go have a nice evening, and
19 leave your notebooks with Mr. Neal.

20 Drive carefully and don't discuss the case
21 with anybody if you don't mind. Don't go online now
22 and try to find a cheap computer.

23 MR. ROBERTSON: Thank you.

24 (The jury is out for the evening.)

25 THE COURT: Tell them we'll start at nine in

WEAVER - DIRECT

730

1 the morning before they get out of here.

2 How much longer do you expect your
3 examination is going to be? I've interrupted a lot.
4 So I know I've slowed you down. So I'm sorry.

5 MR. ROBERTSON: Don't apologize, Your Honor.
6 It's been helpful in many instances. So thank you.

7 When I sat down at the break, I tried to cut
8 out about 40 pages of it, and I just wanted to make
9 sure I didn't cut out something that was critical. I
10 need to go through indirect infringement and do that
11 at a fairly high level. Then I need to march through
12 the claims, and that takes a little bit of time.

13 THE COURT: I'm just asking you roughly how
14 much time instead of some unit I don't understand.
15 I'm not going to hold you to it. I don't think that's
16 fair in a case like this, particularly when I
17 interrupt and take your time.

18 MR. ROBERTSON: You have been patient, sir.
19 I'd like to look at my outline, but I'm going to give
20 you my best estimate right now, and that would be two
21 hours.

22 THE COURT: We'll start in the morning.

23 Anything else we need to deal with? What
24 about this issue about the briefing on graphic user
25 interface? Did you all discuss that as you told me

WEAVER - DIRECT

731

1 you would?

2 MR. ROBERTSON: We have, Your Honor. My
3 suggestion to Mr. McDonald was that we think it's all
4 going to shake out in the wash and in calling back
5 some of these witnesses. We don't think that it
6 raises any -- I don't think it raises any significant
7 issue on appeal, and I would certainly say I'm not
8 going to use it as a basis of an appeal.

9 What I think my understanding of it, Your
10 Honor, and I've been thinking of it a little bit. Mr.
11 McDonald and I maybe don't have the same
12 understanding.

13 THE COURT: Did you have go back to the
14 transcript and see where it was raised? It was
15 Mr. McDonald's objection.

16 MR. ROBERTSON: I think what happened is I
17 objected when Mr. McDonald was crossing Mr. Momyer
18 with respect to whether it would be an infringement
19 if --

20 THE COURT: I'm sorry. Mr. McDonald's
21 question.

22 MR. ROBERTSON: Yes.

23 THE COURT: Yes.

24 MR. ROBERTSON: And I objected, Your Honor.

25 THE COURT: Yes.

1 MR. ROBERTSON: As to whether it would be an
2 infringement if a GUI was used or wasn't used. I know
3 I'm paraphrasing and probably butchering his question.
4 I objected, I thought, on two bases. One was because
5 he was asking a fact witness who didn't have the
6 benefit of your construction to give an opinion. And
7 I also objected, I believe, on the basis of the fact
8 he was asking about a claim term that he then had to
9 comply that the Court had construed.

10 Later on I asked Mr. Johnson about what did
11 you do to modify the RIMS system to become the
12 electronic sourcing system, which is the subject of
13 the patents. And he indicated, and, again, I'm just
14 summarizing, that he had to go from this green screen
15 character technology monitor to this graphical user
16 interface to make it more user friendly, shall we say.

17 My questions I was attempting to direct is
18 just what did you do, not -- I was asking a technical
19 question, essentially, as to what a GUI is. So in my
20 view the two are not in conflict in any way, shape or
21 form, but I don't think it's going to have any impact
22 on the outcome of this. And I certainly don't want to
23 spend a lot more money briefing. And that was a
24 sentiment that Mr. McDonald and I shared, but I won't
25 speak for Mr. McDonald.

WEAVER - DIRECT

733

1 MR. McDONALD: Your Honor, the concern I have
2 that relates to these issues has to do with the
3 inventors talking about some wonderful things they did
4 as far as the commercial embodiment of some product
5 they're trying to make. Whereas, the question that
6 really would be relevant -- by the way, Dr. Weaver is
7 sitting here. So maybe it's appropriate to dismiss
8 him at this point.

9 THE COURT: Yes.

10 (The witness was excused from the witness
11 stand.)

12 THE COURT: For the court reporter, GUI is
13 G-U-I.

14 THE COURT REPORTER: Thank you, Your Honor.

15 MR. McDONALD: The concern I have is at this
16 point, Your Honor, there may be some confusion where
17 the inventors were talking about a development towards
18 the commercial embodiment of a product and how that
19 differed from that RIMS prior system, whereas the real
20 issue should be what's in the patent, what's described
21 in the patent as the invention in the claims.

22 I haven't had a chance to finish looking at
23 the transcript there. I thought I would be getting to
24 Mr. Weaver today, but that didn't quite happen.

25 I'm wondering through the questioning of

WEAVER - DIRECT

734

1 Mr. Weaver I could get to those issues since he is
2 going to be qualified to talk about the claims here.

3 So I would suggest why don't we see how that
4 goes at least for another day, and if that doesn't fix
5 it, we'll have to go to plan B.

6 THE COURT: All right.

7 MR. McDONALD: Thank you.

8 MR. ROBERTSON: Let me foreshadow a problem I
9 can see with that, Your Honor. And some of the
10 means-plus-function claims you construed you identify
11 the GUI as structure that can perform the function. so
12 I certainly don't want Dr. Weaver cross-examined on
13 what his understanding is of your construction.

14 He took your construction and he applied it.
15 And so I think that line of questioning would be
16 improper. I just want to bring that to your
17 attention.

18 THE COURT: Wait just a minute. I may have
19 it all wrong, but I thought that the debate you-all
20 had that prompted my question was the fact that
21 graphic user interface wasn't defined, and you were
22 going to ask me to define the term, and I was going to
23 say if you're going do that, I want to have you brief
24 it. That's what I thought. That's what my question
25 related to.

1 MR. ROBERTSON: Oh, I'm sorry, Your Honor.
2 Then we completely misunderstood. But graphical user
3 interface is not a claim term in any of the asserted
4 claims, so there's no reason for the Court to construe
5 it.

6 THE COURT: All right. Well, then if you
7 said I defined it in the means-plus-function --

8 MR. ROBERTSON: No, sir. In the
9 means-plus-function analysis, the Court had to do a
10 two-step analysis.

11 THE COURT: What's the function? What's the
12 structure?

13 MR. ROBERTSON: Right. You did that. Then
14 you identified the structure because you need to
15 identify the structure from the patent as providing
16 that functionality. That's what is required of a
17 means-plus-function claim. When you did that in some
18 of the claims you construed, you identified the
19 representative structure as including the GUI for
20 performing certain of the steps like, for example,
21 means for selecting the product catalogs to search, a
22 means for displaying the search results.

23 Those are displayed on the screen. And, you
24 know, that is what the GUI is. It's the graphical
25 user interface that permits the user, for example, to

WEAVER - DIRECT

736

1 get the search results back and view them,
2 essentially.

3 THE COURT: You're really saying -- you're
4 talking out of both sides of your mouth without
5 intending at all to be pejorative. It's late in the
6 day, and I lost what I was going to say, but,
7 essentially, what I was going to say is you seem to be
8 taking a different position.

9 Where is the first place in the
10 means-plus-function module that uses the interface?

11 MR. ROBERTSON: For example, at page 3 of the
12 glossary, Your Honor.

13 THE COURT: Yes. Yes, it's in the means for
14 entering product information that at least partially
15 describes at least one desired item. And the function
16 is defined. And then the structure is, "The
17 corresponding structures, materials, or acts, of this
18 element are disclosed as a user interface operating on
19 a computer through which a user may provide input; and
20 one or more software modules that provide product
21 information describing an item or a combination
22 thereof, and their equivalents."

23 I did not in that at all, as you just
24 suggested or as I thought you suggested, define what a
25 user interface was.

WEAVER - DIRECT

737

1 MR. ROBERTSON: No, sir.

2 THE COURT: And you said you didn't want Dr.
3 Weaver to be asked any questions about what was a
4 user interface, I think. So to me that presents sort
5 of a different side of the coin, but it's the same
6 coin you're talking about, though.

7 What do you see is going on here and what do
8 you think really is at issue, Mr. McDonald?

9 MR. McDONALD: Your Honor, I am concerned
10 about the issue of the jury being confused and the
11 ePlus having it both ways because the inventors if
12 they come in and say, We came up with a great
13 invention because it's got a wonderful graphic user
14 interface, then everybody thinks that that's part of
15 the invention, that we got into some validity type of
16 testimony, as much as we tried to avoid it. And then
17 all of a sudden you say, okay, fine. That's a great
18 invention. We want to use it. And they come back and
19 say, wait a minute, our claims don't require graphic
20 user interface. That's got nothing to do with the
21 claim's scope. That's the confusion, I think, that's
22 going to exist but that I was hoping I could clear up
23 with my question of the inventors during the case.

24 THE COURT: What I intended to was to say you
25 had to question him in your case, but anyway I'm not

WEAVER - DIRECT

738

1 quite sure I know what the issue is now. I'll let
2 you-all define it and give me a little paper on it in
3 the morning. Tell me what it is and then I can go
4 from there and we'll decide what's going on. I think
5 maybe your time and mine will be better spent if we do
6 that.

7 MR. ROBERTSON: Could I just point out to
8 Your Honor in that very same definition that you read,
9 this corresponding structure, this is at page 3 of the
10 glossary. In the "See, e.g.," that's where you're
11 claiming -- you're providing examples of the structure
12 that can perform that function. And you'll see at the
13 bottom it says, Graphical interface 254.

14 Now, if you look at figure 1B of any one of
15 the patents, 254 is the graphical user interface. So
16 Your Honor identified that as a structure that
17 actually helps perform the function that you had
18 defined.

19 THE COURT: Yes, I agree with that. Why
20 can't he ask him about it then?

21 MR. ROBERTSON: Ask Dr. Weaver?

22 THE COURT: Or anybody. Why can't he ask
23 them whether that infringes, whether what they have
24 infringes, for example? I don't understand why he
25 can't question about that.

WEAVER - DIRECT

739

1 MR. ROBERTSON: I don't know who he's going
2 to question about it.

3 THE COURT: I'm sure he's going to question
4 Dr. Weaver based on what he said. Not because I'm
5 prescient or anything.

6 MR. ROBERTSON: I guess I don't have an
7 objection to that.

8 THE COURT: Well, good then. We solved
9 something.

10 Raise the blinds so that in the morning it
11 will be open.

12 All right. I think that's everything. And
13 you don't expect to finish tomorrow, is that right,
14 Mr. Robertson? You don't expect to finish tomorrow,
15 is that what your situation is?

16 MR. ROBERTSON: I do not, sir. I expect Mr.
17 McDonald might have a half an hour or 45 minutes of
18 cross-examination.

19 THE COURT: If you ask your questions bullet
20 points, 30 minutes is plenty. Once you get beyond
21 that, the expert bets you is generally what happens.

22 All right. Okay. So we're not going on
23 Monday. You're going back on Tuesday. Thank you very
24 much. Hope you feel better, all of you. Don't bring
25 anything else up here.

WEAVER - DIRECT

740

1

2 (The proceedings were adjourned at 5:15 p.m.)

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25